EXAMINATION OF LEADERSHIP
MODELS
AND
WOMEN IN LEADERSHIP

BY: SYDNEY KARLOS
LIS 707

Introduction

Over the last few decades, there has been and increase in research done on the three different leadership models across all professions, not just information institutions. These leadership models most commonly used are called transformational leadership, transactional leadership, and facilitative leadership. Each model varies in how the leader approaches leadership and the way that they interact with their team or organization. With each model, there are qualities or traits that leaders are expected to have to be seen as successful. Qualities of a leader seem to be consistent across the different leadership models. The five competencies of effective leaders and managers are cognitive ability, vision, interpersonal effectiveness, managerial effectiveness, and personal attributes. This paper aims to explore how these qualities are applied to women in leadership positions. Along with this, this paper will use the different leadership models to explore how there are different expectations between men and women as leaders, inequality in the workplace, gender bias and stereotypes, and how women are treated in leadership positions. Continuing, this paper will also take a look at the obstacles women face in applying to leadership positions and different theories rooted in women and leadership. Across different theories that are explored by professionals in the industry, there is one consistent conclusion to their research. "Barriers to women's leadership operate at different levels within the organizational hierarchy, ranging from the top leadership team down to supervisory levels, and theories about women's underrepresentation also highlights factors at different levels of analysis, ranging from macro-level contextual factors, such as societal cultural values, to various organizational processes, with a particular focus on interpersonal processes…" (Lyness, Grotto, 2018, p. 231).

Leadership Models

To begin, there are quite a few definitions of leadership but for the library profession there is one that is agreed upon among many professionals. For information professionals, "leadership is more of a relationship between people than the characteristics of a single individual" (Wong, 2017, p. 107). The leadership models, transformational leadership, transactional leadership and facilitative leadership, all have different definitions but have some similarities also. Relationships among people remain the most important aspect of these models when put into action. Across all the leadership models listed above, almost all have similar factors that are identified by library administrators as ideal qualities. These qualities are empathy, vision, communication, and flexibility. (Chow, Rich, 2013).

Recently, another quality has been identified to be a characteristic of good leadership and management, called emotional intelligence (EI). Emotional intelligence is, "the ability to control emotions and anticipate and react appropriately to other people's emotions" (Chow, Rich, 2013). Research conducted indicates that many people that apply to leadership positions do so in order to measure the success of their careers but underestimate how much of being a leader is based around the people around them. (Chow, Rich, 2013). A significant part of being a good leader is based around pushing aside their own needs for the benefit of the team or organization. While a leader can have their own aspirations for their career, their success is measured by how well they focus on the vision and goals of the organization in which they are leading in.

Different leaders use different types of leadership models. Transformational leaders aim to push aside their own self-interests for the growth of their team and the ability to inspire

change (Chow, Rich, 2013). Another model used by leaders is transactional leadership. Transactional leadership, "falls in the line of the carrot stick approach to management where leaders provide incentives for their employees to meet goals" (Chow, Rich, 2013). In my opinion, this model can become tricky if used consistently over long periods of time. If employees expect an incentive every time they want to achieve a goal, if they are not offered that incentive, they may no longer want to reach their goals or become passive with their work.

Another leadership model chosen is facilitative leadership. The definition of facilitative is, "helpful, providing service or assistance" (Merriam-Webster, n.d.). A facilitative leader, "involves followers as much as possible creating the group's vision and purpose, carrying out the vision and purpose, and building a productive and cohesive team" (Chow, Rich, 2013). This goes back to the idea that leaders must push aside their self-interests for the betterment of the team they are leading. Again, good leaders are determined by how their teams responds to them and the measure of the success a team has.

There is another leadership model that is occasionally used called adaptive leadership. This model is defined as, "the practice of mobilizing people to tackle tough challenges and thrive" (Wong, Chan, 2018, p. 113). This form of leadership almost sums up the three other models. They all strive to bring success to their teams.

These four models of leadership differ in how leadership is approached but what remains consistent is the need to push aside self-interests. Earlier in this section, the paper explains how the vision, goals, and purpose of the organization must come first. These models may be different but they all strive for the same goal which is creating work and an environment that is in line with the vision, goals and purpose of the organization in which they are serving.

Gender Stereotypes

Gender stereotypes are one of the ways to address the challenges women face when in leadership positions. Gender stereotypes are, "culturally shared beliefs that dictate expectations about how women and men are and how they ought to live" (Gipson, Pfaff, Burke, 2017). There are many different traits that are looked for in leaders, and this proves to be a barrier to women's advancement in the leadership roles. As said in the book, *Women and Leadership*, "Most of the traits that people attribute to leaders are those traditionally viewed as masculine: dominance, authority, assertiveness. These do not seem attractive in women" (Rhode, 2017, p. 10). While these traits are used to describe a good leader, women are often criticized or punished for displaying these traits. People often receive these traits differently depending on the gender that is exuding them. These views of masculine traits play into stereotypes, gender bias, and discrimination against women in the workplace.

There are two different stereotypes that are used when describing gender. Descriptive stereotypes dictate that women are communal and warm. Prescriptive stereotypes prescribe that women should be communal (Gipson, Pfaff, Burke, 2017). As you can see, these two stereotypes are contradictory and can become confusing for women. Agentic characteristics are also one of the ways that stereotypes play a role in the obstacles women in organizations face when trying to advance in their careers. Agentic stereotypes are the stereotypical masculine traits. This is illustrated in research that says, "…men are often stereotyped with agentic characteristics such as being confident and assertive. Incidentally, agentic characteristics are often seen as requisite traits for leadership" (Gipson, Pfaff, Burke, 2017). Going back to the

book, *Women and Leadership*, these traditional views of leadership are based on men's personalities and when women act in the same type of way, they are punished because of society's stereotypes on what a woman should be. In effect, "…women face trade-offs that men do not. Aspiring female leaders may be liked but not respected, or respected but not liked, in settings that require individuals to be both in order to succeed" (Rhode, 2017, p. 12). In relation to leadership models, leadership is based upon the relationships leaders have with their team or organization. If being liked and respected are required to succeed in a leadership role, is it possible for women to succeed if they are unable to meet these requirements due to the stereotypes that women face in the workplace? The stereotypes of traits that women are supposed to have has a considerable effect on the advancement of women's careers.

In an interview with reference librarian Amanda Herrmann at Prospect Heights Public Library, she describes the traits that she believes are important for leaders to have. The traits she described were understanding goals, good listening, and the ability to make informed decisions (See Appendix A). Her traits seem to follow the theory that women have a more sensitive approach to leadership while also including the theory of emotional intelligence where a leader is able to control their emotions and appropriately respond to other's emotions.

Societal Expectations

Building upon gender stereotypes, the expectations of different societal roles for men and women further shows how women are viewed as leaders. Gender bias and societal exceptions often can be grouped together but the difference is that societal exceptions are related to the behaviors that are expected of genders while gender bias based around treating a person

differently because of their gender. In our society, women are seen as those of the caretaker or homemaker while men are seen as the breadwinner. These roles facilitate how women are viewed in a leadership position.

For example, the family plays a big role in the advancement of men versus women in an organization. There is a notion that whatever a woman is doing, she should be doing something else. These contradictory thoughts often show up when a woman decides whether or not to have a family. These decisions have considerable effects on whether or not they get a leadership role or how they are treated in the leadership roles that they are already in. Research has shown that, "Those who seem willing to sacrifice family needs to workplace demands appear lacking as mothers. Those who take extended leaves or reduced schedules appear lacking as leaders" (Rhode, 2017, p. 20). These mixed messages often lead to confusion for women. Many have to choose between having a family or being a leader. Although, sometimes in society, women who do not have children are looked down upon for not maintaining the societal expectation of being a mother. On the contrary, men do not face these same confusing expectations. When men choose to have or not to have a family, this is not taken into consideration when being in a leadership role or when looking for the position. These domestic responsibilities are passed along to women while men seem to be able to avoid them. This ability to get out of domestic responsibilities means there is no or very little career interruptions for men, unlike the many that women face when deciding to be a mother (Gipson, Pfaff, Burke, 2017). These interruptions in women's careers is what creates the inequalities in the career development of men versus women. In the book, *Women and Leadership*, author Deborah L. Rhode says, "Women with

demanding work and family responsibilities often lack time for the networking and mentoring activities that are necessary for advancement" (Rhode, 2017, p. 20).

The expectations of women is a doubled sided sword. "…female leaders' choices are constrained by threats from two directions: Conforming to their gender role can produce a failure to meet the requirements of the leader role, and conforming to their leader role can produce a failure to meet the requirements of their gender role," professionals say. (Gipson, Pfaff, Burke, 2017). Once again, the description of leadership models are mostly based on the characteristics of men. In response to the question of differences between how men and women lead, Amanda Herrmann says that she sees a difference in how women seem to be more open to listening and are more conscious of how they are portraying themselves (See Appendix A).

There are gender-specific traits in western society that are unconsciously or consciously being used when looking at leaders. These societal expectations can influence the perception of those in an organization, particularly those in leadership roles. The reinforcement of conformity is what creates this so-called double-sided sword. When reflecting back to gender stereotypes, this paper points out the traits that are seen as a measure of success for leaders. We live in a patriarchal world where if a woman strays away from the boxes they are put in, there is a sense of distress or loss of respect that many will feel towards her. Already in this world, women are are not seen as equals to men. Women are seen as less competent or not prepared to be a leader because of their more feminine traits, and when women try to succeed in what society considers more "masculine" roles, they are met with obstacles that men do not face that makes it difficult to meet the expectations of that job, but at the same time, are punished for trying to overcome those obstacles.

Women versus Male Leaders

Moving on, behavioral differences play into the ways that women and men are seen as leaders and the differences that determine how each gender is treated in leadership positions. The perception of female leaders is based off of how they act and the traits that they have when being a leader. Behavioral differences between men and women can influence the perceptions of women leaders. Some behavioral differences are, "conflict style, organizational citizenship behaviors, or basic interpersonal interaction styles" (Gipson, Pfaff, Burke, 2017). Gender differences also coordinate with how each gender leads. Within different leadership models, the gender of the leader determines which model they seem to gravitate to or how they apply their behaviors to that model. Research says, "The only gender differences that are consistently supported by evidence on performance are that female leaders are more participatory, democratic, and interpersonally sensitive than male leaders" (Rhode, 2017, p. 5). The trait of sensitivity is often used to describe women rather than men. In relation to leadership models, "… women are more likely than men to engage in transformational leadership, which stresses inspiring and enabling followers to contribute to their organizations" (Rhode, 2017, p. 5).

Going back to transformational leadership, it is based around setting aside self-interest for the good of the organization and inspiring change. Very often it is hard for men to push aside ego which leads to selfishness. Women are more likely to be selfless and sensitive to others needs. The openness to listening allows women to, "…have a leadership advantage in groups performing socially complex tasks (i.e., tasks that require a high degree of interpersonal coordination, such as identifying innovative solutions to problems and jury deliberation)"

(Badura, Grijalva, Newman, Yan, Jean, 2018, pg. 342). Basic interpersonal interaction styles are what separate men and women as leaders. Women are more likely to gravitate to soft skills. Soft skills are like personality traits. Some examples are empathy, emotional intelligence, emotional control, communication skills, and self-awareness.While these skills are extremely important in being regarded as a successful leader, many people will still look towards the traits of being confident, assertive, aggressive, etc. for the measurement of being a good leader. In the interview with Herrmann, she points out how libraries are dominantly run by women. She theorizes that because of the different traits that women have compared to men, they fit better in the role of libraries which is being a place that people trust as a safe place. Women are seen as communal and can sometimes make people feel calmer, which is the environment that many want in a library.

Feminist Phenomenology Theory

A more abstract theory used in relation to women in leadership roles is feminist phenomenology theory. This section will analyze two women's thoughts in relation to this theory, Hannah Arendt and Simone de Beauvoir. To begin, feminist phenomenology is described as, "an umbrella term that considers 'questions related to gendered experience and sexual difference" (Gardiner, 2017). This theory explores how experiences of women and the differences between men and women effect how women use different leadership models and how they are seen as leaders.

An important aspect of feminist phenomenology is, "describing concrete, lived experience" (Gardiner, 2017). Hannah Arendt speaks about leadership as collective action. This

viewpoint relates back to transformational and facilitative leadership models. She argues, "leadership functions best when it arises out of individuals working together over common cause, since they discover the strength of collective action" (Gardiner, 2017). Collective action is what is developed when a leader is able to successfully convey the vision and goals of a company to their team.

On the other hand, Simone de Beauvoir thoughts on feminist phenomenology are, "each individual's ability to succeed is affected by their gender, and gender prejudice is deeply engrained in Western society" (Gardiner, 2017). Going back to earlier in this paper, gender prejudice can be seen between gender bias and gender stereotypes. Male and female leaders are perceived differently in accordance to traits and how they act. "[T]he man is used to being imposing; his clients believe in is competence; he can let himself go; he is sure to impress. The woman does not inspire the same feeling of security in others," Beauvoir says. (Gardiner, 2017). Men are much more likely to be trusted as a leader while many are reluctant to trust a woman in a leadership role. Success comes from the perception of the person and throughout this paper it has shown how women are perceived differently as leaders.

Previously in this paper, it is explained that the traits looked for in a leader are generally masculine traits. When women portray these same traits, they are not welcomed. Many peers do not see this as an attractive trait in women and hinder the respect they receive in leadership positions. Beauvoir says, "It is, therefore, in society's interest that women are perceived as men's peers, but this requires that society affords women the same respect, and opportunities as their male counterparts. In short, for women to succeed within organizational life, the future needs to be radically different from the past" (Gardiner, 2017).

Future

The future of women in leadership roles depends on the organizations commitment to helping women succeed in leadership roles along with creating more opportunities for women to advance to leadership roles. Self-reflection and support in libraries and information institutions can help leaders, in particular, women, grow into leadership roles and find their leadership model to promote the success of their organization and team. When examining leadership behaviors, "..follower interactions are key to a leader's style" (Gipson, Pfaff, Burke, 2017). The ability for women to grow and learn in leadership positions will help libraries and information organizations also develop diverse leadership styles and a more inclusive environment for the team.

Rhode explains that, "To make significant progress…we must confront second-generation problems of gender bias, in-group favoritism, and inhospitable work-family structures" (Rhode, 2017, p. 2). Looking within can help organizations identify when there is gender bias in their companies or if they are supporting the women in their organization enough. When talking to reference librarian Margaret Golembiewski at Prospect Heights Public Library, she, like Herrmann, points out how the profession of librarians is dominantly women (See Appendix A). Golembiewski is a manager at the reference desk. When further thinking about the dominance of women in libraries, is it possible these leadership roles were filled by using traits predominantly shown by men in order to successfully grow into their profession? While these women very obviously got their jobs from being qualified, do women need to put on a facade when interviewing in order to seem more assertive and confident in order to fit the stereotypes

that are seen in leaders? There is opportunity for organizations to look more into how their

interview processes are completed and how leaders in their organization present themselves in

order to succeed in their roles.

Conclusion

Ultimately, leadership models play a crucial role for women in leadership roles. By

synthesizing key points we are able to determine that gender plays a significant role in how

leaders are perceived and if one will advance in their career to a leadership role. The exploration

of different obstacles women face in the industry can help analyze how leadership models apply

to these obstacles. The barriers that women face in being a leader and advancing to leadership

roles reminds them that, "cultural attitudes devalue them the minute they step out or even just

lean back from the workplace" (Rhode, 2017, p. 10). Overcoming gender bias, gender

stereotypes, societal expectations, and behavioral differences is impossible for women to do

unless there is a major change in society. Women will continue to face theses obstacles unless

organizations actively work to change these issues.

Sources

Anderson, C., *Library Marketing and Communications: Strategies to Increase Relevance and Results*. ALA Editions.

Badura, K. L., Grijalva, E., Newman, D. A., Yan, T. T., Jeon, G., (2018). Gender and leadership emergence: A meta-analysis and explanatory model. *Personnel Psychology, 71*(3). 335-367. https://doi.org/10.1177/1742715017729940

Chow, A. S., Rich, M. (2013). The Ideal Qualities and Tasks of Library Leaders: Perspectives of Academic, Public, School, and Special Library Administrators. *Library Leadership and Management.*

Gardiner, R. A., (2017). Hannah and her Sisters: Theorizing gender and leadership through the lens of feminist phenomenology. *Leadership, 14*(3). https://doi.org/10.1177/1742715017729940

Gipson, A. N., Pfaff, D. L., Burke, W. W., (2017). Women and Leadership: Selection, Development, Leadership Style, and Performance. *The Journal of Applied Behavioral Science, 53*(1). https://doi.org/10.1177/0021886316687247

Lyness, K. S., Grotto, A. R. (2018). Women and Leadership in the United States: Are We Closing the Gender Gap? *Annual Review of Organizational Psychology and Organizational Behavior, 5,* 227-265. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-orgpsych-032117-104739

Merriam-Webster. (n.d.). Facilitative. In Merriam-Webster.com thesaurus. Retrieved March 20, 2024, from https://www.merriam-webster.com/thesaurus/facilitative

Rhode, D. L. 2017. *Women and Leadership.* Oxford University Press.

Winston, M. D., Quinn, S., (2005). Library leadership in times of crisis and change. *New Library World, 106*(9/10). 395-415. https://doi.org/10.1108/03074800510623083

Wong, G. K. W., Chan, D. L.H., (2018). Adaptive leadership in academic libraries. *Library Management, 39*(1/2). 106-115. https://doi.org/10.1108/LM-06-2017-0060

Wong, G. K. W., (2017). Leadership and leadership development in academic libraries: a review. *Library Management, 38*(2/3). 153-166. https://doi.org/10.1108/LM-09-2016-0075

Appendix A

Interview Questions

1. What is your experience with leadership roles in the library (have you ever been in one, etc)?

2. How do you show up as a leader even if not in a leadership position?

3. What traits do you think makes a good leader?

4. What do you think is the most important trait or role a leader should have?

5. Do you think there is a difference between how women and men lead?

6. Is there any theories as to why you think libraries are predominantly ran by women?

7. With the current political climate, do you think there are more opportunities for women to come into leadership roles? Do you think this climate has an affect on women in leadership roles?

These are set questions. Other questions came up during the interview when building upon answers.